

# Advanced Placement Programs

Revised January 2020

## Introduction

The Advanced Placement (AP) program started in the 1950s by the College Board as a way to help students earn college credit while still in high school [1]. To earn this credit, students take end-of-year standardized exams that assess college-level content knowledge. Students that score high enough on the exam have the potential to waive introductory-level courses in college. Completion of an AP course is not required to sit for the exam, but many high schools offer them to help students prepare.

In the early years of AP, only a few elite high schools offered courses. Since then, participation has nearly doubled every decade [2] with statistics in Michigan paralleling those seen across the nation [3]. This dramatic increase in participation, coupled with ongoing government support [4], [5], has prompted researchers to investigate the benefits and challenges of AP programming to determine whether or not it merits the resources allocated to it. This research summary highlights the main findings.

## **Key Findings**

#### **Benefits**

Proponents of the AP program advertise its academic, social, and financial benefits. Students that take AP classes gain exposure to an advanced curriculum, boosting the rigor of their high school experience [6], [7]. These students are more likely to be accepted to a selective university [8], complete a bachelor's degree, enroll in graduate school [9], and double major. Students who take an AP exam are also more likely to major in that subject [10], [11]. In some subject areas, such as chemistry, AP participation is associated with better grades in college [12], [1], [13].

AP classes are typically smaller in size and have more experienced teachers [14]. There are generally fewer behavior problems in AP classes, and students say they enjoy being with more academically-minded peers [15], [16].

One of the most compelling aspects of the AP program is the potential to earn college credit while still in high school, potentially saving money in later tuition costs [1]. Advanced credits allow student to bypass several general education requirements and access classes



required for their major sooner. This frees students to select majors that require a greater number of credits to complete, such as those in STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics) fields [6].

#### **Challenges**

While advocates of AP (many of whom are affiliated with College Board) make broad claims about its benefits, other researchers disagree. They argue that many of the positive correlations described previously, such as better grades and increased likelihood of earning a college degree, disappear when controlling for variables such as academic background, family income, and personal work habits [17], [18], [7], [19].

Good grades in AP courses are associated with increased acceptance into more selective universities, but AP credits rarely reduce the time it takes to complete a degree [20]. To graduate early from college, students must earn at least a full semester's worth of credit, which is rare.

While AP participation is growing, pass rates have declined, and the percentage of students earning 1s (the lowest possible score) has increased [21]. For example, from 1999 to 2019, participation grew by over 2.1 million students, but pass rates dropped from 63.8% to 60.6%, and the rate of students earning a "1" increased from 12.2% to 17.5% [22], [23].

While a declining pass rate is expected with increased participation, this cannot be used as an excuse for schools. Taking and passing the AP exam, not the course, is correlated with positive outcomes, so students who do not pass the exam experience almost no benefit [7]. It has been argued that taking a course that emphasizes college-readiness skills (as opposed to college-level content) would be a better use of time for these students [24].

Additionally, taking advanced courses is associated with higher levels of stress [25] and increased usage of lecture as an instructional strategy [26]. AP does not require lecture, but teachers report feeling compelled to lecture because of the substantial amount of content they must cover. This comes at a sacrifice to experiences that foster creativity and critical thinking.

Equity has been a major focus of AP research, with several researchers concluding that the AP program is still not equitable despite ongoing efforts. Family income is still the largest predictor of AP enrollment [24], and the participation and subsequent pass rates of racial minorities are disquieting [27], [4], [28]. In 2019, only 4.2% of Michigan AP test-takers identified as Black despite the fact African American students represent approximately 17% of Michigan's high school population [3], [29]. The College Board does not provide an overall score summary by race, but it does disaggregate individual assessments. Disparities in average scores for the four most popular AP assessments are highlighted in Table 1.

**Table 1.**2019 Average AP Test Scores by Race

AP Test	Black	Asian	White
Name			
English Language	2.0	3.4	2.9
English Literature	1.8	2.9	2.8
U.S. History	2.1	3.4	2.9
Calculus A/B	2.2	3.3	3.1

In line with equity is the research regarding tracking. Tracking is defined as skill-grouping students for instruction [30]. Given that honors and AP courses are a form of tracking, it is



important to consider the impact of this practice when looking to gain a well-rounded perspective of AP programming.

Tracking originated as a well-intentioned management strategy designed to allow for more individualized instruction, but research shows that tracking fails to improve the academic performance of all but the highest achieving students, usually at the expense of their lower-achieving peers [31]. Furthermore, students from lower-income families, students whose parents have lower levels of education, and students of color are less likely to enroll in higher-track classes [32], a pattern mimicked in AP participation previously discussed [33].

One of the most unfortunate realities of tracking is how difficult it can be for students to move from one track to another. To be eligible for the most advanced high school courses, students often begin taking prerequisites in middle school. Missing advanced courses in seventh or eighth grade, especially in math, can make it nearly impossible for a student to register for AP courses in high school, contributing to the opportunity gap [34], [31].

Researchers have proposed several strategies to solve this dilemma. These include embedding honors/AP courses into general classes [35], adopting more culturally relevant practices/curricula [24], and clearly communicating placement classifications and processes to families [36].

## Conclusion

On a global scale, the proclaimed benefits of AP programming are weak. On a finer scale, however, some individual subject areas show promise, making the effectiveness of AP nuanced. For this reason, there are many factors schools should consider when evaluating and possibly expanding their AP programs.

#### What does this mean for schools?

- Ensure all classes (advanced or otherwise) emphasize complex problem solving and creativity, elevating rigor.
- As mentioned earlier, access to and success in AP is largely determined by prerequisite coursework, so focus on improving the sequence of courses that lead to AP before expanding AP course offerings. (That is, look at the progression of courses students must complete in middle school and early high school in order to have the skill set needed to master advanced content later.)
- Examine the current performance of students on AP exams. If few students are passing the exam at a high level, identify underlying causes and implement a plan of action. If ongoing efforts do not improve scores, consider reallocating those resources.
- There is almost no research that examines the relationship between the number of students that pass AP classes versus the number of students that pass AP exams, but at the local level, comparing these statistics could help align and improve AP instruction.
- Research shows that many capable students do not see themselves as "advanced," perpetuating gaps in access. Consider using the College Board's free AP Potential Tool to inform placement decisions [37], [38].
- Stay informed about the research on tracking, and bolster efforts to improve inclusive differentiation.
- Do not neglect other ways students can earn college credit, such as dual enrollment. In the past, some districts put out bids to bring college professors to local high schools which both drove down costs and guaranteed the students credit upon passing the course.



### Resources

- [1] P. L. Ackerman, R. Kanfer, and C. Calderwood, "High school advanced placement and student performance in college: STEM majors, non-STEM majors, and gender differences," *Teach. Coll. Rec.*, p. 43, 2013.
- [2] College Board, "Annual AP program participation 1956-2019." 2019.
- [3] College Board, "Michigan summary 2019." 2019.
- [4] E. Judson, "Science and mathematics Advanced Placement exams: Growth and achievement over time," J. Educ. Res., vol. 110, no. 2, pp. 209–217, Mar. 2017, doi: 10.1080/00220671.2015.1075188.
- [5] Education Commission of the States, "Advanced Placement policies: All state profiles," *Education Commission of the States: Your education policy team*, 2016. [Online]. Available: http://ecs.force.com/mbdata/mbprofallrt?Rep=APA16. [Accessed: 21-Oct-2019].
- [6] B. J. Evans, "How college students use Advanced Placement credit," *Am. Educ. Res. J.*, vol. 56, no. 3, pp. 925–954, Jun. 2019, doi: 10.3102/0002831218807428.
- P. M. Sadler, "Key findings," in AP: A critical examination of the Advanced Placement program, P. M. Sadler, G. Sonnert, R. H. Tai, and K. Klopfenstein, Eds. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Education Press, 2010, pp. 263–270.
- [8] H. M. Breland and American Association of Collegiate Registrars and Admissions Officers, Eds., Challenges in college admissions: A report of a survey of undergraduate admissions policies, practices, and procedures. Washington, D.C: AACRAO, 1995.
- [9] M. C. Long, D. Conger, and P. latarola, "Effects of high school course-taking on secondary and postsecondary success," *Am. Educ. Res. J.*, vol. 49, no. 2, pp. 285–322, Apr. 2012, doi: 10.3102/0002831211431952.
- [10] K. D. Mattern, E. J. Shaw, and M. Ewing, "Advanced Placement® exam participation," p. 40.
- [11] C. Avery, O. Gurantz, M. Hurwitz, and J. Smith, "Shifting college majors in response to Advanced Placement exam scores," *J. Hum. Resour.*, vol. 53, no. 4, pp. 918–956, Oct. 2018.
- [12] B. G. Dodd, S. J. Fitzpatrick, R. J. De Ayala, and J. A. Jennings, "An investigation of the validity of AP grades of 3 and a comparison of AP and Non-AP student groups," College Entrance Examination Board, New York, 2002–9, 2002.
- [13] P. M. Sadler and G. Sonnert, "High school Advanced Placement and success in college coursework in the sciences," in *AP: A Critical Examination of the Advanced Placement Program*, P. M. Sadler, G. Sonnert, R. H. Tai, and K. Klopfenstein, Eds. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Education Press, 2010, pp. 119–138.
- [14] P. M. Sadler, "How are AP courses different?," in AP: A critical examination of the Advanced Placement program, P. M. Sadler, G. Sonnert, R. H. Tai, and K. Klopfenstein, Eds. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Education Press, 2010, pp. 51–62.



- [15] A. Shiu, T. Kettler, and S. K. Johnsen, "Social effects of Hispanic students enrolled in an AP class in middle school," *J. Adv. Acad.*, vol. 21, no. 1, pp. 58–82, Nov. 2009, doi: 10.1177/1932202X0902100104.
- [16] R. C. Foust, H. Hertberg-Davis, and C. M. Callahan, "Students' perceptions of the non-academic advantages and disadvantages of participation in Advanced Placement courses and International Baccalaureate programs," *Adolescence*, vol. 44, no. 174, 2009.
- [17] D. Conger, M. C. Long, and P. latarola, "Explaining race, poverty, and gender disparities in advanced course-taking," *J. Policy Anal. Manage.*, vol. 28, no. 4, pp. 555–576, 2009, doi: 10.1002/pam.20455.
- [18] K. Klopfenstein and M. K. Thomas, "The link between Advanced Placement experience and early college success," p. 20.
- [19] R. T. Warne, "Research on the academic benefits of the Advanced Placement program: Taking stock and looking forward," *SAGE Open*, vol. 7, no. 1, p. 2158244016682996, Jan. 2017, doi: 10.1177/2158244016682996.
- [20] K. Klopfenstein, "Does the Advanced Placement program save taxpayers money? The effect of AP participation on time to college graduation," in *AP: A critical examination of the Advanced Placement program*, P. M. Sadler, G. Sonnert, R. H. Tai, and K. Klopfenstein, Eds. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Education Press, 2010, pp. 189–218.
- [21] E. Judson and A. Hobson, "Growth and achievement trends of Advanced Placement (AP) exams in American high schools," *Am. Second. Educ.*, vol. 43, no. 2, Spring 2015.
- [22] College Board, "Annual AP program participation 1956-2019." 2019.
- [23] College Board, "AP score distributions all subjects 1999-2019." 2019.
- [24] S. Kolluri, "Advanced Placement: The dual challenge of equal access and effectiveness," *Rev. Educ. Res.*, vol. 88, no. 5, pp. 671–711, Oct. 2018, doi: 10.3102/0034654318787268.
- [25] S. M. Suldo, R. F. Dedrick, E. Shaunessy-Dedrick, S. A. Fefer, and J. Ferron, "Development and initial validation of the coping with academic demands scale: How students in accelerated high school curricula cope with school-related stressors," *J. Psychoeduc. Assess.*, vol. 33, no. 4, pp. 357–374, Jul. 2015, doi: 10.1177/0734282914552165.
- [26] H. Hertberg-Davis, C. M. Callahan, and R. M. Kyburg, "Advanced Placement and International Baccalaureate programs: A 'fit' for gifted learners?," The National Research Center on the Gifted and Talented, University of Connecticut, University of Virginia, and Yale University, RM06222, Nov. 2006.
- [27] A. Rodriguez and K. M. McGuire, "More classes, more access? Understanding the effects of course offerings on Black-White gaps in Advanced Placement course-taking," *Rev. High. Educ.*, vol. 42, no. 2, pp. 641–679, 2019, doi: 10.1353/rhe.2019.0010.



- [28] B. P. Scafidi, C. Clark, and J. R. Swinton, "Who takes Advanced Placement (AP)?," *East. Econ. J. Basingstoke*, vol. 41, no. 3, pp. 346–369, Summer 2015, doi: http://dx.doi.org.proxy2.cl.msu.edu/10.1057/eej.2014.21.
- [29] State of Michigan, "Student count," *MiSchoolData: Student counts*, 2019. [Online]. Available: https://www.mischooldata.org/DistrictSchoolProfiles2/StudentInformation/StudentCounts/Student Count2.aspx. [Accessed: 02-Jan-2020].
- [30] J. A. Belkhir, "Tracking in the schools: Perceptions and attitudes of parents," *Race Gend. Cl.*, vol. 17, no. 1/2, p. 16, 2010.
- [31] S. Kelly and H. Price, "The correlates of tracking policy: Opportunity hoarding, status competition, or a technical-functional explanation?," *Am. Educ. Res. J.*, vol. 48, no. 3, pp. 560–585, Jun. 2011, doi: 10.3102/0002831210395927.
- [32] T. Domina, A. McEachin, P. Hanselman, P. Agarwal, N. Hwang, and R. W. Lewis, "Beyond tracking and detracking: The dimensions of organizational differentiation in schools," *Sociol. Educ.*, vol. 92, no. 3, pp. 293–322, Jul. 2019, doi: 10.1177/0038040719851879.
- [33] L. Barnard-Brak, V. McGaha-Garnett, and H. Burley, "Advanced Placement course enrollment and school-level characteristics," *NASSP Bull.*, vol. 95, no. 3, pp. 165–174, Sep. 2011, doi: 10.1177/0192636511418640.
- [34] C. Dougherty and L. T. Mellor, "Preparing students for Advanced Placement: It's a preK-12 issue," in AP: A critical examination of the Advanced Placement program, P. M. Sadler, G. Sonnert, R. H. Tai, and K. Klopfenstein, Eds. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Education Press, 2010, pp. 219–232.
- [35] D. Nurenberg, "Honoring all learners: The case for embedded honors in heterogeneous English language arts classrooms," *Engl. Educ. Urbana*, vol. 49, no. 1, pp. 63–98, Oct. 2016.
- [36] J. Worthy, "Only the names have been changed: Ability grouping revisited," *Urban Rev.*, vol. 42, no. 4, pp. 271–295, Nov. 2010, doi: 10.1007/s11256-009-0134-1.
- [37] College Board, "The College Board AP Potential," 2019. [Online]. Available: https://apcentral.collegeboard.org/about-ap/start-grow-ap/grow-ap/ap-potential. [Accessed: 28-Oct-2019].
- [38] E. Sidney Vaughn, "Reform in an urban school district: The role of PSAT results in promoting Advanced Placement course-taking," *Educ. Urban Soc.*, vol. 42, no. 4, pp. 394–406, May 2010, doi: 10.1177/0013124510361843.

